FUTURE REGULATION OF CROSS-BORDER AUDIOVISUAL CONTENT DISSEMINATION

A Critical Analysis of the Current Regulatory Framework for Law Enforcement under the EU Audiovisual Media Services Directive and the Proposal for a European Media Freedom Act
Mark D. Cole | Christina Etteldorf

FUTURE REGULATION OF CROSS-BORDER AUDIOVISUAL CONTENT DISSEMINATION

A Critical Analysis of the Current Regulatory Framework for Law Enforcement under the EU Audiovisual Media Services Directive and the Proposal for a European Media Freedom Act
Preface

The European Union is based on core values. Yet, the protection of a free European media environment by independent regulatory authorities is getting more complex and is facing new challenges, especially with regards to the cross-border dissemination of audiovisual content.

With the Digital Services Act and the Digital Markets Act, before that the eCommerce and above all the AVMS Directive, and most recently with the proposal for a European Media Freedom Act (EMFA) the European Commission is complementing the legal framework aiming to protect democratic standards in the media and to strengthen law enforcement in the online world. These laws are necessary and while their importance is undisputed problems arise in their application. Therefore, solutions are urgently needed in view of the increasing importance of the cross-border distribution of audiovisual content.

In addition to questions of the distribution of competences between the various regulatory institutions, the independence of these institutions and the creation of coherence between the various legal acts, considerable difficulties continue to arise in practice in cross-border law enforcement. It is now up to the legislators to address these difficulties – also with a view to the currently discussed EMFA proposal.

The study conducted by the Institute of European Media Law (EMR) on behalf of the State Media Authority NRW addresses these challenges by providing an extensive analysis of the EU legal framework and pointing towards the need of amending the AVMS Directive.

I thank Prof. Dr. Mark D. Cole and his team for their excellent work and wish you, dear readers, an inspiring lecture.

Dr. Tobias Schmid
Director of the State Media Authority of North Rhine-Westphalia and European Affairs Commissioner of the Conference of Directors of the German Media Authorities (DLM)
Overview of contents

Table of contents

Executive Summary 13
Zusammenfassung 43
List of Abbreviations 75
A. Introduction 79

B. Challenges of a Cross-Border Media Environment in the EU 85
   I. Current Risks and Rising Phenomena 85
   II. Fundamental Values of the European Union and Allocation of Powers 87
   III. Regulatory Approaches – Existing and Planned 91
   IV. Scenarios for Illustration 111

C. The Audiovisual Media Services Directive (AVMSD): The Status Quo 115
   I. The Latest 2018 Revision in a Nutshell 115
   II. Illegal Content under the AVMSD 117
   III. The Country-of-Origin Principle and Derogation Procedures – Art. 3 AVMSD 127
   IV. The Possibility of Member States to Enact Stricter Rules – Art. 4 AVMSD 155
   V. Demanding Effective Compliance and Enforcement – The Relevance of Art. 4(6) AVMSD 162

D. The Institutional Dimension: AVMSD and Beyond 167
   I. Institutional System in the AVMSD 167

https://doi.org/10.5771/9783748939856-1, am 15.09.2023, 18:38:54
Open Access – http://www.nomos-elibrary.de/agb
## Overview of contents

II. A Look at Media-oriented Institutional Approaches beyond the AVMSD  
III. Other Oversight Systems and Their Institutional Structure  
E. Applying the Findings to the Illustrative Scenarios and Gaps Identified  
F. Approaches and National Solutions Concerning Current Challenges  
   I. The Degree of (Non-)Harmonisation on EU Level  
   II. Content Standards: the UK Example  
   III. The Idea of ‘Staatsferne’ on a European Level  
   IV. Co-regulatory Approaches with Different Types of Codes of Conduct  
   V. Comparability of Regulatory Bodies and Cooperation Mechanisms  
G. Conclusion: On the Way to Enhanced Efficiency and a Modernised Regulatory Framework  

Bibliography
Table of contents

Executive Summary 13
Zusammenfassung 43
List of Abbreviations 75

A. Introduction 79

B. Challenges of a Cross-Border Media Environment in the EU 85
   I. Current Risks and Rising Phenomena 85
   II. Fundamental Values of the European Union and Allocation of Powers 87

III. Regulatory Approaches – Existing and Planned 91
   1. Existing Regulatory Approaches 92
   2. Planned Regulatory Approaches 99
   3. Consistency and Coherence? 106

IV. Scenarios for Illustration 111

C. The Audiovisual Media Services Directive (AVMSD): The Status Quo 115
   I. The Latest 2018 Revision in a Nutshell 115
   II. Illegal Content under the AVMSD 117
      1. Incitement to Violence or Hatred based on Discrimination 117
      2. Content Endangering Minors 120
      3. Certain Types of Commercial Communication 123
      4. Application of the Rules to VSPs 124
   III. The Country-of-Origin Principle and Derogation Procedures – Art. 3 AVMSD 127
      1. Background to the Country-of-Origin Principle 127
         a. Introduction of an explicit rule to devise responsibility of Member States 127
### Table of contents

b. The consequence of the country-of-origin principle in the AVMSD 129  
c. Other codifications of the country-of-origin principle 131  
2. Current Scope of the Country-of-Origin Principle 133  
a. The determination of jurisdiction concerning a provider 133  
b. The necessary distinction between EU-based providers and third country providers 135  
c. Specific challenges 138  
   (1) The actual jurisdiction criteria and their application 138  
   (2) The situation of third country providers or licences 139  
3. Possibilities and Procedures to Derogate from the Country-of-Origin Principle 142  
a. Explaining the system 142  
b. Application cases 145  
4. Institutional Cross-Border Cooperation: The Role of ERGA 149  
a. The definition of ERGA’s role in the AVMSD 149  
b. The Memorandum of Understanding between ERGA Members 152  
5. Interim Conclusion on the Derogation Mechanism 154  

IV. The Possibility of Member States to Enact Stricter Rules  
   – Art. 4 AVMSD 155  
1. The Question of Scope: Fields “Coordinated” by the AVMSD 155  
2. Procedure for Tackling Circumvention Situations 157  
   a. Explaining the system 157  
   b. Application case 159  
3. Institutional Dimension 160  
4. Interim Conclusion on the Circumvention Mechanism 161  

V. Demanding Effective Compliance and Enforcement  
   – The Relevance of Art. 4(6) AVMSD 162  

D. The Institutional Dimension: AVMSD and Beyond 167  

I. Institutional System in the AVMSD 167
## II. A Look at Media-oriented Institutional Approaches beyond the AVMSD

1. The Approach of the Digital Services Act (DSA)
   a. Designation and powers of supervisory authorities
   b. Competences in cross-border matters and with regard to very large providers
   c. European Board for Digital Services
   d. Cooperation structures

2. The Proposed Future Cross-border Cooperation Mechanism of the EMFA
   a. National regulatory authorities or bodies
   b. Role of the Commission
   c. European Board for Media Services
   d. Cooperation structures

## III. Other Oversight Systems and Their Institutional Structure

1. Overview of Comparable Approaches
2. The Approach in the European Electronic Communications Code
   a. Independent supervisory authorities
   b. Competences and tasks
   c. The Body of European Regulators for Electronic Communications
   d. Cooperation and consistency
3. The Approach in the General Data Protection Regulation
   a. Fundamental rights basis
   b. Institutional system of the GDPR
      (1) Independent supervisory authorities on the national level
      (2) Competences and tasks
      (3) The European Data Protection Board
      (4) Cooperation and consistency
   c. First experiences with the cooperation mechanism
Table of contents

E. Applying the Findings to the Illustrative Scenarios and Gaps Identified 205

F. Approaches and National Solutions Concerning Current Challenges 217
   I. The Degree of (Non-)Harmonisation on EU Level 217
      1. Dealing with Non-EU Providers 217
      2. Degree of Substantive Harmonisation 221
   II. Content Standards: the UK Example 224
   III. The Idea of ‘Staatsferne’ on a European Level 229
      1. The Principle of ‘Staatsferne’ in the German Framework 229
      2. Suitability on Union Level 233
      3. Possible Implementation at EU Level: the EMFA Proposal 236
      4. Specifically: Independence of Oversight Bodies 238
   IV. Co-regulatory Approaches with Different Types of Codes of Conduct 239
      1. General Observations 239
      2. The Example of Data Protection Law 240
   V. Comparability of Regulatory Bodies and Cooperation Mechanisms 243
      1. The System in the Digital Services Act 243
      2. The Approach of the European Electronic Communications Code 245
      3. Cooperation under the General Data Protection Regulation 248
      4. Institutional Dimension of the EMFA Proposal 252

G. Conclusion: On the Way to Enhanced Efficiency and a Modernised Regulatory Framework 259

Bibliography 263