Europe. The book as a whole is appropriate for both undergraduate courses and graduate seminars in the fields of anthropology, sociology, political science, Slavic studies, gender and women's studies, and for survey courses on Europe. Activists and policymakers interested in promoting democratization in post-communist countries should also pay keen attention to Creed's important critique of Western preconceived notions of what constitutes appropriate forms of civic organizing in chapter three. Overall, "Masquerade and Postsocialism" is a delightful read on a fascinating but woefully understudied country.

Kristen Ghodsee

Donham, Donald L., and **Santu Mofokeng:** Violence in a Time of Liberation. Murder and Ethnicity at a South African Gold Mine, 1994. Durham: Duke University Press, and London, 2011. 238 pp. ISBN 978-0-8223-4853-5. Price: £ 14.99

This is a beautifully produced book. The pictures alone are worth the price of admission. It is also beautifully written, thoughtful, intelligent, meticulous in making arguments, and humble in making its case and in acknowledgement of others' work. For those who are interested in debates about the often violent ambiguities of "liberation" (in South Africa and elsewhere), this is a must read. It is also a masterpiece of anthropological narrative in its own right. Like any engaging detective story, it will be widely read.

Donham focuses on a single case, the murder of two Zulu-speaking mineworkers at a mine he calls "Cinderella." The event took place on Soweto Day, about six weeks after the first free South African elections in 1994. As Donham (1) puts it, "black workers ganged up on the Zulus among them and slowly, determinedly hacked two to death." Most observers, black and white alike, interpreted the killing in ethnic terms, as an example of "Xhosas" attacking "Zulus." A few, more in the know, saw it as an attack by local members of the National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) on members of the United People's Union of South Africa (UPUSA), the Inkatha union on the mine. In the context of the "East Rand War," then winding down in the area of Cinderella mine, however, that in itself was code for "Xhosas killing Zulus," since Inkatha was a militantly anti-ANC (and COSATU) organization based in the KwaZulu homeland under Chief Mangosuthu Buthelezi, the NUM was firmly in the ANC camp, and the ANC was supposedly dominated by "Xhosa."

Very few workers from KwaZulu Natal were in fact recruited to work on the South African gold mines. After the 1987 strike, however, some mine managers deliberately sought Zulu workers because they were believed to be less militant. As a result, there came to be a small proportion of workers classified as Zulu on certain gold mines.

Some of them were Inkatha members and Buthelezi's stance was deeply conservative. This emerges, for instance, from a Gencor management report I found in Naas Steenkamp's files about a relatively minor work stoppage at Matla Colliery in 1988 where "two Zulu employees were killed and 22 injured during sporadic fighting between union [NUM] and non-union (mainly Zulu) workers following protests at the mine against the proposed Labour Relations Bill." NUM union leadership at Matla Colliery was very strong, however. Gencor talked to the NUM Head Office, local management permitted a mass meeting, and production resumed within a few days.

A delegation of Matla management and employees visited the "homeland" government in KwaZulu the day work resumed. According to the Matla report, Buthelezi insisted "that the violence at Matla was a revenge action planned by the NUM for violence that took place at Hlobane some time ago which was initiated by Inkatha/Uwusa … Mr. Buthelezi argued that the NUM was affiliated with COSATU and COSATU with the ANC. COSATU is supporting disinvestment and sanctions whilst the KwaZulu government is opposing it. He stated that we [management] were feeding the crocodile with the hope that it would eat us last."

I mention this report at some length because I think Donham tends to play down the importance of fears of Inkatha (and police) violence on Cinderella mine. On his own account, Inkatha activists at Cinderella had direct access to the South African Police Internal Stability Unit with their armoured vehicles (99). That said, I concur with Donham's argument that most of the small minority of Zulu workers at Cinderella were not Inkatha activists. Many were innocent victims caught in the antagonism between Inkatha and the ANC. There are about a dozen accounts of "labour unrest" in the TEBA (mine recruitment agency) archives for the period from 1987 to 1996 that include reports of "Zulu problems." In all but two of these situations, the scenario depicted by Donham plays itself out. Workers in the Zulu minority are more or less summarily dismissed from the mine.

In the case of Cinderella, the murders on Soweto Day, six weeks after the election, resulted from a fight on the mine during which Zulu-speaking workers were hunted out of the compound on Easter Day, two months before the election. As a result of management's ethnic assumptions, all classificatory "Zulu" workers (including many who had not been targets of the hunt) were taken out of the compound and housed elsewhere. At that moment, the matter became "tribal" and the Zulu component of the mine work force was doomed to eventual discharge. Meanwhile, however, management sent "the Zulus" home on paid leave. It was on their return after the historic 1994 election that the Soweto Day killings occurred.

Management at Cinderella handled the return of the Zulu workers ineptly. They were brought back four days earlier than the date agreed with the NUM and mine security forces were not on the alert. Closer liaison with the NUM and better security might have avoided the Soweto Day clash or at least ensured a less deadly outcome.

Donham, however, does not think so. This is because he believes that NUM organization on the mine was more to blame for the Soweto Day killings than mine management. The NUM on Cinderella had come into being extraordinarily swiftly (within the space of less than nine months) primarily as a result of changes at the head office in Johannesburg, where a new human resources man-

ager transformed the recognition process almost overnight.

The mobilization process was enabled by the existence on the mine of a Xhosa-speaking worker network, an *amabutho* (literally a regiment), who jumped onto the NUM bandwagon with the encouragement of one of the union organizers and brought the union into being. They were quite prepared to use violent methods where necessary. Indeed, Donham elides this particular Xhosa *amabutho* with the violent criminal gangs, usually ethnically based, that have always existed in the shadow of the mine compounds. I am not sure that his evidence supports this supposition, but it may indeed be so. At any rate, it is this Xhosa *amabutho* that Donham holds directly responsible for the Soweto Day killings which were certainly preplanned and consciously carried out. It is not unusual for local union leaders and shop steward committees to have "enforcers," tough comrades who are willing and able to initiate wildcat actions, rough up strike breakers, and keep members otherwise in line. Perhaps this was the role of the Xhosa *amabutho* at Cinderella mine?

Finally, on a macropolitical level, this book is haunted by two ghosts that continue to stalk contemporary South African society. One is the incompleteness of the South African transition. Some of Donham's most moving writing addresses this point. Let me quote at length, for instance, from pages 123–124:

"In late April 1994, black South Africans were freed. They became equal citizens before the law. But the underside of this triumph was that it became virtually impossible to recall the process that created this state of 'freedom' – how enormous wealth had been produced for a few while the multitude had been reduced to the status of workers (if they were fortunate) or to the ranks of the reserve army of the unemployed (if they were not) … [A]s time collapsed to a moment, social classes dissolved into autonomous individuals. Now, poor black South Africans – whose material lives were hardly to be affected by the transition – were just like everyone else. They had things to buy and sell. Never mind that the only thing that most of them had to sell – if they were lucky – was their capacity to toil in places like Cinderella. This denouement was all but covered up by the celebration of black liberation."

The second ghost haunting Donham's narrative operates on the level of inclusion in the new South Africa. Black liberation comes to South African citizens only – indeed especially to those who fought on the right side in the struggle, members of the ANC and of the COSATU unions. Zulu may have now been redeemed by Jacob Zuma, but in mid-1994 they were seen as alien, not fully citizens. Insurgent citizenship is always ambiguous, both liberating and excluding at the same time. Donham (184) quotes a participant in xenophobic violence in a squatter settlement near Cinderella in 2008. The foreigners, the young man said were "enjoying *our* freedom." The very notion of "freedom," then, is redolent with irony. This is the most disturbing conclusion to be drawn from this fascinating book. T. Dunbar Moodie

Fash, William L., and **Leonardo López Luján** (eds.): The Art of Urbanism. How Mesoamerican Kingdoms Represented Themselves in Architecture and Imagery. Washington: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection, 2009. 480 pp., Fotos. ISBN 978-0-88402-344-9. Price: $ 49.95

This volume from Dumbarton Oak's 2005 Pre-Columbian Symposium brings together articles that examine how pre-Hispanic Mesoamerican cities defined and represented themselves in urban art and architecture – the art of the city and the city as art. Although variable in size and layout, all pre-Hispanic cities contained planned civic-ceremonial precincts where expressions of power, history, and cosmology intersected. This volume is part of a growing body of work by archaeologists using concepts of landscape and the built environment to explore symbolic dimensions of urbanism and how their production shaped social relations.

The editors approach pre-Hispanic urbanism through the concepts of cosmovision – the notion of ancient cities as earthly representations of cosmological and astrological order – and landscape, and the built environment. Following the editors' introduction, the subsequent dozen chapters, organized according to Mesoamerican culture history, examine individual centers beginning with a discussion by Ann Cyphers and Anna Di Castro of early Olmec centers and the development of core Mesoamerican cosmological concepts – vertically layered cosmos, caves as underworld portals, sanctified inanimate objects, duality, and sacred mountains. Cyphers and Di Castro see an early expression of urban place-making at Early Preclassic San Lorenzo as a hill emerging from a watery surface, akin to the Late Postclassic concept of *altepetl*.

Gillespie and Grove in their chapter on Chalcatzingo, an early gateway center in Central Mexico with ties to the Gulf Coast, emphasize the distinction between the visible and invisible worlds. As expansion of agricultural and nonagricultural landscape modifications circumscribed the invisible world to special places, marking such places afforded certain people access to the unseen. The San Bartolo murals of the Late Preclassic Maya lowlands, discussed by William A. Saturno, depict rulership as "god given" with a Maya Ahaw's coronation taking place in the Sky Band.

Early Mesoamerican cities expressed on a monumental scale the intertwining of political and cosmological orders. Joyce Marcus writing about Monte Albán links early urbanism, formal layouts, monumental architecture, and mountains with this new political order – the city of Monte Albán atop a mountain, "living sacred beings." Uruñuela and colleagues explore how volcanic eruptions literally and symbolically shaped central Mexican urbanism. Preclassic village volcano shrines in Puebla grew to gigantic proportions at the Great Pyramid at Cholula where as elsewhere resettlement played a key role in political centralization and urbanism.

Mesoamericans acknowledged the power of mountains in shaping their world and leaders and rulers presented themselves as harnessed to or controlling those powers. Once heralded as the Great Goddess of Teoti-